

## Determination of Market Rent

Exhaustive research has been on-going since June 2023. I have utilized internet sites ZILLOW, REDFIN, FACEBOOK Marketplace, Zanesville Rentals, and telephoned Shield Property Management and individual owners of currently rented properties in Muskingum County. My search was for the entirety of Muskingum County from Blue Rock to South Zanesville to Zanesville.

Comparable 2 meets or exceeds all points of comparability which are noted on the RE 611 (T). Comparable has been rented by the same tenant for one year at \$900.00 plus utilities and tenant is required to maintain the grass. This property has the same amount of rooms as the subject property with off-street parking available. This property has A/C where the subject property does not have any cooling at all. This property is located in a better area with access to shopping and other necessary shopping needs. This property has city water and sewer to the property. Property is in good condition and is considered DS&S. With the adjustments for A/C, age of the property, water and sewer availability, and electric heat calculated rent is \$400.00 per month plus utilities.

Comparable 3 meets or exceeds all points of comparability which are noted on the RE 611(T). The property has been rented for the past six months. The rent is \$895.00 per month plus utilities and maintenance of the grass. This property has more rooms and living space than the subject property and window air conditioners provided to the tenant. This property has been maintained adequately to remain DS&S. Property is in fair shape and after the adjustments to the rent for additional square footage and the window air conditioners, the market rent is calculated at \$445.00 per month plus utilities.

The subject tenants were not charged rent due to a family member owning the property. This market rent determination is made based on the information gathered from Shields Properties, Missy Brest, Chad James and Tami Passwaters, all independent owners of rental properties in Zanesville Municipal Area. Rented units range from \$800 to \$1200 and a determination was made after subtracting the betterments in the comparable properties to the subject property that \$445 was equal to the condition of the properties and location. Utilities information was gathered from the Zanesville Metropolitan Housing Authority, 01/01/2023 published.

When using the \$445.00 plus the utility information from the ZMHA Grid = \$144.00, for a market rent of \$599.00.

**I request approval of Market Rent Research and Computation.**

  
**Kimber L. Helm**

**Realty Specialist Manager**



## MEMO TO FILE

**January 18, 2024**  
**MUS-376-5.09**  
**Parcel 010-1**  
**PID 115989**

### **Determination of Rent Supplement Payment**

**Description of Subject: 8895 Gaysport Hill Road, Blue Rock, OH 43720**

The subject property is located at 8895 Gaysport Hill Road, Blue Rock, OH 43720. The subject is a one-story converted schoolhouse located in a rural residential area of Muskingum County, Ohio. The subject sits on 1.061 acres of land on a hill above Blue Rock/Gaysport, Ohio. Most of this property is heavily wooded with a steep ravine topography surrounding the house. This home sits on a hill and is accessed by a long, narrow drive. There is limited mowable, usable lawn. The project has a take area of 1.061 acres due to the instability of the hill the property sits on in Blue Rock. There is no garage for this home, though there is a carport in poor condition and barn that sits down in the ravine. This barn is not utilized by the tenant/occupants, but by a third party. The subject property has four rooms, one bath, which includes a Living Room, combination kitchen/dining room, one full bathroom, and 2 bedrooms. There also is a utility room, which is not included in the total room count, but which was considered in searching for comparables and another room utilized for storage. There is a room blocked off, which could be a bedroom, but it has a collapsed ceiling. It should be noted that the appraiser states there are four bedrooms—per my inspection, one is considered storage only and one is uninhabitable as noted above. The appraisal also states that there is baseboard heat, but upon inspection, the owner verified there is currently only heat by a wood pellet stove. There is no central air.

The property has 1296 sq ft of living space per auditor. There is a partial basement and part cellar, both areas considered unsafe. Due to the lack of utility of several rooms, and the inability to enter them to measure, the estimated habitable living space of this home is 918 (estimated). The property has a deck and carport. The basement is unfinished and considered uninhabitable to the instability of the foundation. The building was originally built in 1885 and used as a schoolhouse until decommissioned in 1950's and sold in late 1950 to be used as a residence. The heating by pellet stove, unknown condition of the well servicing the property and the septic system does not seem to be up to code. The property is in poor maintenance and is not decent, safe, and sanitary due to the condition of two of the upper rooms.

Subject property is unique in its initial constructed use as a schoolhouse has been altered through the years to add divided living space and bedrooms.

## **Description of Comparable Properties as compared to Subject Property:**

### **Comparable 1 804 Race Street, Zanesville, OH 43701**

Comparable 1 is a one-story, single-family home. The home contains four rooms, kitchen, living room, two bedrooms and one full bath. The basement is clean and dry and can be utilized for storage. This property has laundry area off the kitchen and connected to the rear entrance to the property. This property has a nice front porch, a small back porch, a storage building and off-street parking.

This comparable is considered equal to the subject property but in better condition with additions of yard area both front, side and back. The room count is equal to the subject. The square footage is less than the subject but all 813 sq ft of this property is in good condition and usable space, where the subject property has about 1000 sq ft of unusable space due to safety of the floor. This comparable property is considered to be in good condition with newer flooring in the bedrooms and kitchen area. The parking is equal to or better as the subject based on two accessible parking spots where the subject has limited space to park and turnaround to exit the property. The comparable property has two separate storage options in a 12 by 12 shed and the basement which has approximately 300 sq ft of storage. The comparable property is located in Zanesville, Ohio on a city street, on approximately 0.11 of an acre. This comparable property has access to the front of the house on a city street and an alley which allows access to the off-street parking. The properties are similar in age of construction. This property does have a stove and refrigerator available to the tenants.

### **Comparable 2 1504 Carroll Street, Zanesville, OH 43701**

Comparable 2 is a two-story, single-family dwelling with 2 Bedrooms and 1 Bath upstairs, a kitchen, family/dining room and large living room. The basement is clean and dry and available for storage. This property has a laundry area in the large kitchen area. There is a bonus room that can be used as a family room or dining room. There is a nice carpeted living room. The stairs to the 2<sup>nd</sup> floor can be accessed from the dining area and the family room. Upstairs, both bedrooms have a private door to the bathroom. Both bedrooms have closet space existing. There is storage area in the mudroom accessed from the back door.

There is a nice front porch and back porch attached to the property. This property has two off-street parking spaces identified by block wall and cement slab. There is a 12 x 12 shed available for storage in the back yard. There is parking along the front of the property as well. This location is on a side street with only one neighbor.

Compared to the subject property this rental property has air conditioning available, a new furnace, nice wooden floors and carpet in the living room. Property is on city water and sewer. Comparable property is considered to be better than the subject based on usable space and condition of the home. This comparable is situated on 0.0960 acres of land and has 1248 sq ft of living space and 300 sq ft basement. The properties are similar in age, but the comparable is in better condition.



### **Comparable 3 947 Moxahala Avenue, Zanesville, OH 43701**

Comparable 3 is a one-story, single-family home on a busy main street in Zanesville, Ohio. This property has less living space at 645 sq ft. There are two bedrooms, but one bedroom is 8 x 8, and the other bedroom has the front door which opens into the bedroom as compared to the size of both rooms at the subject bedrooms are larger. The kitchen is a small room with laundry hook up. The kitchen does have a stove and refrigerator available for use by the tenants. The comparable property has off-street parking in the rear. This property is in the city and has city water and city sewer. Though this property is smaller in size than the subject property it is thought to be better than the subject as the condition with the new flooring and appliances. This property is situated on 0.1020 acres of land which is close to shopping.

Compared to the subject property, this property is considered to be equal to or better due to the condition and location. This property has a large side yard and backyard for use by the tenants. The back porch and front porch equal the deck, but the subject setting is a wooded area away from the city. Neither property has a garage so equal.

### **Determination of Prime Comparable**

An exhaustive search has been on-going since June 2023. I have utilized ZILLOW, REDFIN, FACEBOOK Marketplace, Zanesville Rentals, and driven the area looking for Owner Rental signs. I have had discussions with the three local rental/property agencies in Muskingum County. My search was for the entirety of Muskingum County from Blue Rock to South Zanesville to Zanesville. I have visited six properties and determined that Comparable 1 is a suitable relocation location for Thomas and Hope. This property is deemed to be equal to or better than the subject property due to condition of the subject. Comparable 1 has air conditioning and a newer furnace, city water and sewer as compared to the subject property's pellet stove, well and septic.

Comparable 1 meets or exceeds all points of comparability which are noted on the RE 611 (T). Comparable is available and meets the necessary criteria and has been chosen as the Prime Comparable for determination of the Rent Supplement Payment.



**Kimber L. Heim**

**Relocation Agent**

**D5 Realty Specialist Manager**





**MEMO TO FILE**

**Date:** January 17, 2024

**TO:** Patty Moorman – Relocation Reviewer

**FROM:** Kimber L. Heim  
Realty Specialist Manager

**RE:** Request for Approval  
Rent Supplement Payment  
Last Resort Housing Use Approval

The subject property is located at 8895 Gaysport Hill Road, Blue Rock, OH 43720. The subject is a one-story converted schoolhouse located in a rural residential area of Muskingum County, Ohio. The subject sits on 1.061 acres of land on a hill above Blue Rock/Gaysport, Ohio. The project has a take area of 1.061 acres due to instability of the hill the property sits on in Blue Rock. The subject property has five rooms, which include Living Room attached to the kitchen/dining room, a bathroom, a utility room, and 2 bedrooms. Several other rooms are uninhabitable due to age and deterioration so these rooms were not counted in the total room count.

The property has 1,918 sq ft of living space per the auditor and a basement which is unsafe. The property has a deck and carport. The basement is unfinished and considered uninhabitable to the instability of the foundation. The building was originally built in 1885 and used as a school house until decommissioned in 1950's and sold in late 1950 to be used as a residence. The property is in poor maintenance and borderlines on decent, safe, and sanitary due to the condition of two of the upper rooms, heating by pellet stove, unknown condition of the well servicing the property and the septic system does not seem to be up to code.

Subject property is unique in its initial constructed use as a schoolhouse has been altered through the years to add divided living space and bedrooms.

## Determination of Prime Comparable

An exhaustive search has been on-going since June 2023. I have utilized internet sites ZILLOW, REDFIN, FACEBOOK Marketplace, Zanesville Rentals, and driven the area looking for Owner Rental signs. I have had discussions with the three local rental/property agencies in Muskingum County. My search was for the entirety of Muskingum County from Blue Rock to South Zanesville to Zanesville. I have visited six properties and determined that Comparable 1 is a suitable relocation location for Thomas and Hope. This property is deemed to be equal to or better than the subject property due to condition of the subject. Comparable 1 has air conditioning and a newer furnace, city water and sewer as compared to the subject property's pellet stove, well and septic.

Comparable 1 meets or exceeds all points of comparability which are noted on the RE 611 (T). Comparable is available and meets the necessary criteria and has been chosen as the Prime Comparable for determination of the Rent Supplement Payment.

It is my opinion the Prime Comparable is equal to or better than the subject. The subject tenants were not charged rent due to a family member owning the property. A market rent determination was made based on the information gathered from Shields Properties, Missy Brest, Chad James and Tami Passwaters, all independent owners of rental properties in Zanesville Municipal Area. Rented units range from \$495 to \$800 and a determination was made that \$675 was equal to the condition of the properties and location. Utilities information was gathered from the Zanesville Metropolitan Housing Authority, 01/01/2023 published.

When using the \$445 plus the utility information from the ZMHA Grid = \$144.00, for a market rent of \$599.00.

Compared to the 830 Race Street, Zanesville OH comparable rent of \$850 plus utilities as determined using the ZMHA grid = \$208.00 for a total Replacement Rental Cost per month of \$1,058.00.

To calculate the Rent Supplement Payment the difference between \$1,058.00 and \$599.00 is determined to be \$459.00 which multiplied by 42 months = **\$19,278.00** as a Rent Supplement Payment to be provided Thomas Rodgers and Hope Miller.

Per section 6607.01 of the ODOT Real Estate Manual, Determination to Provide Housing of Last Resort. Whenever a project or program cannot proceed on a timely basis because of comparable replacement rental properties are limited or quickly on and off the market within the monetary limits of \$7,200, the displacing agency shall provide additional or alternate assistance under the provisions of Laas Resort Housing.

The exhaustive, lengthy search of all rental properties available from Gaysport/Blue Rock through Maple Avenue in Northern Zanesville has calculated out to an amount above the \$7,200 limit. If nothing is available within the limit of \$7,200, the displacing agency will provide rental supplement payment under the provisions of Last Resort Housing.

The condition of the subject property and the added hurdle of market rent calculation being required as no rent was being paid to Property owner and the current market for rental properties in the area has caused our search to exceed the RSP monetary limit of \$7,200.00. Therefore, I am requesting approval for use of Last Resort Housing.

**I request approval of this RSP (Rent Supplement Payment) and the use of Last Resort Housing (LRH) due to disparity between displacement site market rent and replacement site rent.**



**Kimber L. Heim  
Realty Specialist Manager  
Relocation Agent**





STATE OF OHIO DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION  
RELOCATION ASSISTANCE AGENT'S NOTES

MUS	376	5.09
County	Route	Section
010-1		115989
Relocation Parcel No.		PID
Thomas Rodgers, Hope Miller		
Relocatee's Name(s)		

*NOTE: All entries must be typed and signed or initialed by the Agent on the date of entry. To add an additional row, tab from the end of the last Entry field.*

Date	Entry
06/07/23	Allison Durant and Tricia Polt attempted contact with Charlie Rodgers by going to a second location attached to a family member. Allison was able to speak with Charlie's mother, Jenny, cell 740-704-1526, who informed Allison the house in Gaysport was purchased for Thomas but because of his age at the time, the deed was to Charlie Rogers. She provided a phone number for Charlie and stated she would get in contact with her as well. <span style="float: right;">KAT</span>
06/08/23	Allison Durant and I entered the property at 8895 Gaysport Hill Road, Gaysport, OH 43720. The property has a very long driveway. Mr. Rodgers was not home but the cousin, Aydin, was at home prior to going to work. Aydin gave entry to the property, and we walked around on the inside to get a baseline as the property has been under rehabilitation for years to create living space from the historic schoolhouse/church. Aydin showed us the newly remodeled utility/laundry room which is attached to the bathroom which was being upgraded but was unfinished at the time with tile, flooring, or paint/wall coverings. Aydin provided his contact information and let us know he would have Thomas contact us when he saw him later that day. I let Aydin know that as a tenant I would need information concerning his status once determinations were able to be made. He understood what was going on and how it affected him in the future. He told me he would have Thomas call me. Aydin provided me his cell phone number 740-647-2404, texting is easier. <span style="float: right;">KAT</span>
06/08/23	Thomas called me and provided his contact information and his sister, Charlie's, contact information. <span style="float: right;">KAT</span>
06/09/23	I was able to speak with Charlie Rodgers to discuss necessity of meeting face to face at the property. Ms. Rodgers explained she is very pregnant and taking it day-to-day, so appointment needed to be scheduled in the next week or so. We agreed to an appointment 06/15/2023. I asked her if it was OK to visit the site and contact the <span style="float: right;">KAT</span>

	people living at the property, her brother, and their cousin. Ms. Rodgers was agreeable and I let her know Allison Durant and myself would be travelling to the displacement site on 06/15/2023.	KCA KCA
06/14/23	Coordinated visit with appraiser, Nathan Garnett.	
	Pre-Acquisition Survey Meeting	
06/15/23	Patty Moorman, Allison Durant, Kimber Heim, and the contract appraiser, Nathan Garrett were scheduled to meet at the property at 10:00 am, 6/15/2023.	
	As we arrived at the displacement property located at 8895 Gaysport Hill Road, Gaysport, OH, 43720, the appraiser, Nathan Garrett, had already arrived. Recorded owner, Charlie N. Rogers, her father, Thomas Rodgers, Sr., and Charlie's toddler arrived at 10:00 am as well.	
	At this time, I proceeded to the front door and was met by Thomas Rodgers and Aydin Foley.	
	Charlie Rodgers, her father, Allison Durant, and Patty began to discuss the project and walked through the upper area of the property.	
	Thomas introduced himself to me and let me know his girlfriend who lives with him had already left for work. I told him thanks for letting me know there is another occupant besides Aydin and himself. I explained ODOT was planning a project which would require a complete acquisition of the 1.061 acre property to include their current home. I let Thomas and Aydin know my role in this process of Relocation Assistance was to gather information for their relocation and to provide the three of them, Thomas, Hope and Aydin, services required by a Federally mandated program to assist them in transitioning from the displacement site, where they live now, and the replacement site.	
	I gathered all the names and contact information from Thomas, Aydin and Thomas provided me Hope's cell phone number and name. Thomas explained the property was in his sister's name due to his age when the property was acquired. I let him know this will impact the details for the relocation. Thomas further explained Charlie did not have any personal property in the house or on the property. I explained Thomas, Hope and Aydin are tenants residing at this location would be considered for consideration of rent supplement payment (RSP) and moving costs associated with moving the personal property from this location and to the new location chosen by them. I emphasized that to be eligible for relocation benefits they would need to be occupying the home at the time the offer to purchase the property is made to Charlie. If they move before the offer is made, they will not be eligible for benefits. I explained how the Rental Assistance Program worked. I provided both Thomas and Aydin the residential relocation assistance brochure. I explained the brochure will be a guide for the process and provides information about the possible benefits for tenants being displaced from a home.	
	Thomas took me in to the structure through an entryway into a remodeled schoolhouse/church per the historical information I have found associated with Gaysport and the original plat. Once you leave the entryway, you enter an open room	

KCA